

Judicial Innovation

November 25, 2008

Judicial Innovation

Which judges innovate and are judges rewarded or punished for innovation?

- * Democrat-appointed judges are more likely to overturn lower court decisions and they do so to distinguish lower court opinions (develop new law) as opposed to saying they are in error (with respect to existing law).
- * Cases where the US is appealing are particularly likely to be reversed and cases where the US is appellee are less likely to be reversed.
- * Reversed cases subsequently receive more citations overall as well as more negative citations as a proportion of total citations. They are much more likely to be distinguished (receive a caution citation) than to be directly overruled (warning citation).
- * When an appeals court reverses a lower court opinion by distinguishing it, other appeals courts not ready to follow the example of the leading appeals court cites the case negatively.
- * This treatment of judicial innovation holds across all case types.

Data

- 1970-1985
 - At least 5 years of active non-senior duty on a single circuit
 - Demographics: school, birth, death, race, sex, senior, party, when, religion, urban
 - Behavior: opinions written, dissent and concurrence rate, appearances, ideology
 - Experience: district judge, state judge, state government, local government, congress, government attorney
- 50 randomly selected cases for which judge wrote the majority
 - Decision: full reverse, some reverse, reverse+dismiss, reverse+dismiss+remand, reverse+remand, nonaffirm
 - Citations: total, negative, positive, negative proportion, positive proportion, ignore
 - Case type: admin, criminal, civil-US, civil-private, bankruptcy, Civil rights, contracts, forfeiture, intellectual property, labor law, local, non-civil, prisoner petitions, real property, social security, tort injury, tort personal property
 - Government: US plaintiff, US defendant, US appellant, US appellee (474 missing)
 - Panel behavior: dissent, concurrence
 - Ideology of lower court (1783 missing)
 - Length of opinion
- Whether opinion has the word “error” in it; or “distinguish” (law-making)

Summary Statistics

- Democrat nominees reversed 42%
- Republican nominees reversed 38%
- Reversals positively correlated with “distinguish” but negatively correlated with “error”;
- Democrats less likely to use the word “error”
- Not affirming and distinguish positively correlated; Not affirming and error are negatively correlated
 - Plaintiff in error
 - Html includes dissents
 - Repeating appellant’s argument
 - Saying there’s an error but still agree with outcome (?)
- Reversals result in more citations of each type
- But disproportionately more negative citations
 - Can’t tell if they’re within-circuit or not

Democrat Nominees (Table 1)

	(1) dem_nominee	(2) dem_nominee	(3) dem_nominee	(4) dem_nominee	(5) dem_nominee	(6) dem_nominee	(7) dem_nominee	(8) dem_nominee
female	0.430*** (0.0900)	0.334** (0.118)	0.381** (0.127)	0.433** (0.151)	0.434** (0.165)	0.306 (0.164)	0.293 (0.160)	0.293 (0.159)
nonwhite	0.405** (0.141)	0.402** (0.153)	0.346* (0.164)	0.180 (0.254)	0.192 (0.253)	0.238 (0.233)	0.262 (0.234)	0.259 (0.233)
age	0.0358 (0.0646)	0.00668 (0.0549)	0.0164 (0.0528)	0.0000437 (0.0307)	-0.00333 (0.0300)	0.0108 (0.0343)	0.00904 (0.0357)	0.00956 (0.0357)
age2	-0.000324 (0.000554)	-0.000147 (0.000462)	-0.000226 (0.000446)	-0.0000606 (0.000275)	-0.0000291 (0.000270)	-0.000189 (0.000307)	-0.000181 (0.000321)	-0.000184 (0.000321)
senior	-0.611*** (0.145)	-0.548*** (0.138)	-0.639*** (0.167)	-0.0151 (0.0818)	-0.0312 (0.0805)	-0.0921 (0.0804)	-0.0992 (0.0810)	-0.0963 (0.0814)
experience	0.00887 (0.0181)	0.0189 (0.0174)	0.0199 (0.0163)	0.0208* (0.00944)	0.0220 (0.0117)	0.0210 (0.0128)	0.0212 (0.0138)	0.0214 (0.0138)
exp2	-0.000132 (0.000880)	-0.000327 (0.000902)	-0.000302 (0.000846)	-0.000641 (0.000331)	-0.000658 (0.000371)	-0.000326 (0.000394)	-0.000359 (0.000416)	-0.000363 (0.000416)
lawschool	0.171 (0.102)	0.224* (0.0931)	0.232* (0.0929)	0.417*** (0.0812)	0.410*** (0.0797)	0.393*** (0.0774)	0.394*** (0.0769)	0.395*** (0.0765)
privatecollege	0.0134 (0.0952)	0.0654 (0.0974)	0.0980 (0.0979)	0.0251 (0.102)	0.0285 (0.104)	-0.0248 (0.0995)	-0.0350 (0.0987)	-0.0340 (0.0988)
missingcollege	0.321* (0.145)	0.285 (0.163)	0.244 (0.174)	-0.00426 (0.228)	-0.0137 (0.224)	-0.0379 (0.201)	-0.0601 (0.205)	-0.0593 (0.204)
crossover_appointment	-0.0804 (0.183)	-0.117 (0.186)	-0.0760 (0.186)	0.153 (0.255)	0.143 (0.254)	0.136 (0.232)	0.123 (0.233)	0.125 (0.233)
urban	-0.0684 (0.0867)	-0.0164 (0.0861)	0.0359 (0.0844)	0.430** (0.152)	0.425** (0.151)	0.414** (0.146)	0.404** (0.142)	0.403** (0.142)

Democrat Nominees (Table 1)

- More likely to be female,
 - (goes away when control for judicial behavior)
- non-white,
 - (goes away when control for religion and state)
- educated at elite law school,
 - (always strong)
- urban birth city
 - (enters once you control for religion and state)
- Less likely to have been district court judge, but conditional on being one, more likely to have additional years of district judge experience
 - (always strong)
- More likely to have state judge experience
 - (enters once you control for religion and state)
- Less likely to be Episcopalian, Congregationalist, Christian Scientist
 - (very different when didn't control for state fixed effects)
- More likely to write opinions for cases with US plaintiff, civil rights, prisoner petitions, and social security
- Somewhat more likely to write opinions for tort injuries, labor law, contract
- Robust standard errors clustered at the judge level

Reversals (Table 2)

	(1) somereverse	(2) somereverse	(3) somereverse	(4) somereverse	(5) somereverse	(6) somereverse	(7) somereverse	(8) somereverse	(9) somereverse
dem_nominee	0.0387* (0.0173)	0.0278 (0.0186)	0.0240 (0.0191)	0.0304 (0.0158)	0.0572* (0.0223)	0.0601** (0.0225)	0.0667** (0.0216)	0.0714** (0.0212)	0.0683** (0.0216)
female		0.0764* (0.0362)	0.0716* (0.0361)	0.0651 (0.0344)	-0.000428 (0.0332)	-0.00980 (0.0364)	-0.0236 (0.0346)	-0.0302 (0.0347)	-0.0340 (0.0353)
nonwhite		-0.00957 (0.0273)	-0.0150 (0.0265)	0.00629 (0.0258)	0.0819* (0.0404)	0.0826* (0.0413)	0.106* (0.0444)	0.0742 (0.0456)	0.0723 (0.0462)
age		0.00766 (0.0167)	0.00444 (0.0174)	-0.00113 (0.0145)	-0.0187 (0.0150)	-0.0152 (0.0150)	-0.0151 (0.0149)	-0.00605 (0.0142)	-0.00485 (0.0145)
age2		-0.0000704 (0.000140)	-0.0000393 (0.000147)	-0.000000234 (0.000124)	0.000168 (0.000130)	0.000134 (0.000130)	0.000138 (0.000129)	0.0000659 (0.000124)	0.0000575 (0.000126)
senior		0.168*** (0.0345)	0.152*** (0.0385)	0.153*** (0.0401)	0.265*** (0.0330)	0.253*** (0.0342)	0.239*** (0.0419)	0.271*** (0.0402)	0.264*** (0.0418)
experience		0.00437 (0.00483)	0.00438 (0.00487)	0.00446 (0.00470)	0.00415 (0.00473)	0.00415 (0.00472)	0.000215 (0.00854)	0.00505 (0.00860)	0.00543 (0.00849)
exp2		-0.000162 (0.000216)	-0.000186 (0.000223)	-0.000136 (0.000227)	-0.000293 (0.000228)	-0.000303 (0.000230)	-0.000413 (0.000229)	-0.000392 (0.000217)	-0.000404 (0.000216)
lawschool		0.0182 (0.0194)	0.0187 (0.0202)	0.0330 (0.0187)	0.0201 (0.0219)	0.0224 (0.0218)	0.0253 (0.0179)	0.0275 (0.0183)	0.0292 (0.0187)
privatecollege		-0.0149 (0.0165)	-0.0120 (0.0183)	-0.00246 (0.0173)	0.0110 (0.0216)	0.00840 (0.0223)	0.00431 (0.0196)	-0.000425 (0.0196)	-0.00116 (0.0198)
missingcollege		0.0196 (0.0257)	0.0295 (0.0292)	0.00147 (0.0282)	-0.0516 (0.0332)	-0.0473 (0.0340)	-0.00566 (0.0375)	-0.0192 (0.0397)	-0.0164 (0.0408)
crossover_app		0.00626 (0.0247)	0.00719 (0.0267)	-0.0188 (0.0293)	-0.101* (0.0396)	-0.102* (0.0402)	-0.120** (0.0400)	-0.0819 (0.0420)	-0.0765 (0.0417)
urban		-0.00489 (0.0196)	-0.00748 (0.0212)	-0.0122 (0.0180)	0.0175 (0.0264)	0.0168 (0.0268)	0.00266 (0.0230)	-0.00146 (0.0230)	-0.00148 (0.0229)

Reversals (Table 2)

districtjudge>	-0.00979 (0.0277)	-0.0185 (0.0226)	-0.0106 (0.0268)	-0.0147 (0.0277)	0.00317 (0.0252)	-0.00581 (0.0227)	-0.00608 (0.0231)
districtjudgeyr	0.000332 (0.00311)	0.00169 (0.00259)	0.00272 (0.00270)	0.00306 (0.00275)	0.000864 (0.00275)	0.000606 (0.00274)	0.000669 (0.00277)
statejudgeexp	0.0145 (0.0266)	-0.000370 (0.0225)	-0.0129 (0.0288)	-0.0160 (0.0284)	-0.0183 (0.0269)	-0.0152 (0.0295)	-0.0133 (0.0300)
statejudgeyrs	0.00161 (0.00274)	0.00247 (0.00202)	0.00332 (0.00305)	0.00371 (0.00302)	0.00216 (0.00289)	0.00177 (0.00297)	0.00155 (0.00291)
stategovexp	-0.0239 (0.0286)	-0.0188 (0.0247)	0.00836 (0.0392)	0.0146 (0.0385)	0.0368 (0.0405)	0.0468 (0.0404)	0.0496 (0.0400)
localgovexp	-0.0226 (0.0244)	-0.0222 (0.0224)	-0.0315 (0.0312)	-0.0255 (0.0311)	-0.0244 (0.0273)	-0.0208 (0.0293)	-0.0220 (0.0292)
congressexp	0.0107 (0.0379)	0.0429 (0.0324)	-0.0525 (0.0562)	-0.0630 (0.0565)	-0.0672 (0.0547)	-0.0592 (0.0518)	-0.0626 (0.0518)
govtattyexp	-0.00808 (0.0232)	0.0236 (0.0206)	-0.0286 (0.0227)	-0.0252 (0.0229)	-0.0345 (0.0240)	-0.0168 (0.0251)	-0.0139 (0.0249)

Reversals (Table 2)

judges	0.0000578 (0.0000672)	0.0000349 (0.0000710)	0.0000404 (0.0000710)
opinionby	-0.000165 (0.000232)	-0.000341 (0.000230)	-0.000379 (0.000230)
dissentby	0.00192*** (0.000416)	0.00206*** (0.000365)	0.00210*** (0.000365)
concurby	-0.00171** (0.000648)	-0.00173** (0.000580)	-0.00179** (0.000584)
admin		0.221*** (0.0595)	0.222*** (0.0595)
crim		0.244*** (0.0579)	0.243*** (0.0579)
civilus		0.378*** (0.0654)	0.445** (0.146)
civilpr		0.353*** (0.0592)	0.424** (0.145)
bankrupt		0.300*** (0.0652)	0.301*** (0.0652)
dissent		0.0671 (0.0365)	0.0630 (0.0358)
concur		-0.00566 (0.0399)	-0.00606 (0.0394)
concdiss		0.0676 (0.0728)	0.0690 (0.0723)
usplaintiff		-0.0549 (0.0391)	-0.0647 (0.0422)
usdefendant		-0.00915 (0.0309)	-0.0278 (0.0314)
usappellant		0.183*** (0.0312)	0.183*** (0.0313)
usappelee		-0.0574** (0.0212)	-0.0567** (0.0213)

Reversals (Table 2)

- Democratic nominees 3% more likely to reverse (and distinguish - vary)
 - Becomes much stronger when control for (birth) state fixed effects
 - Significance decreases using increasingly affirming measures
 - full reversal, some reversal, reverse+dismiss, reverse+dismiss+remand, non-affirm

Focusing on some reversal

- Females 7% more likely to reverse (there are 8 females)
 - Switches to minorities 9% (there are 10 nonwhites), once control state
- Senior judges 17%-27% more likely to reverse (10 opinions by seniors)
- 1st circuit unlikely to reverse*
- Crossover appointments unlikely to reverse
- Church of Christ, Mormons, Christian Scientists don't like to reverse
 - (goes away when control for case type)
- Reversals correlated with less concurrences, more dissents
- Other type of cases, less likely to reverse; social security, more likely
- US appellant - more likely to reverse
- US appellee - less likely to reverse
- Collapsing to judge level - * facts are robust

Reversals (Table 3)

- For different case types
 - Democrats reverse
 - Civil US, Civil, US plaintiff, non-civil prisoner, tort injury and tort property
 - Less likely to reverse labor law
 - [Occasionally significant: female, age, senior, law school, college, previous district or state experience, religion]

	(1) somereverse	(2) somereverse	(3) somereverse	(4) somereverse	(5) somereverse	(6) somereverse	(7) somereverse	(8) somereverse	(9) somereverse	(10) somereverse	(11) somereverse
dem_nominee	0.0881 (0.0456)	0.115** (0.0370)	0.0508 (0.0369)	0.0611* (0.0277)	0.0352 (0.0489)	0.106 (0.102)	0.0594 (0.0308)	0.254* (0.108)	0.0449 (0.0320)	0.113 (0.0724)	0.0316 (0.0866)
	(12) somereverse	(13) somereverse	(14) somereverse	(15) somereverse	(16) somereverse	(17) somereverse	(18) somereverse	(19) somereverse	(20) somereverse	(21) somereverse	(22) somereverse
	-0.0319 (0.0952)	0 .	0.251 (0.293)	-0.447** (0.162)	0.0775* (0.0310)	0.0140 (0.0607)	0.164 (0.0973)	11.01 (6.820)	-0.556 (0.774)	0.264** (0.0900)	23.79*** (1.04e-08)

Citations (Table 5)

	(1) citations	(2) citations	(3) citations	(4) citations	(5) citations	(6) citations	(7) citations	(8) citations	(9) citations	(10) citations
somereverse	2.605** (0.805)	2.572** (0.801)	2.588** (0.797)	2.434*** (0.721)	2.487*** (0.706)	2.447*** (0.678)	2.447*** (0.673)	2.124** (0.678)	2.049** (0.650)	2.401*** (0.681)
female		0.637 (1.231)	0.476 (1.372)	0.142 (1.068)	3.876 (2.016)	3.154 (2.077)	4.876 (2.697)	5.571* (2.627)	5.369* (2.591)	
nonwhite		0.489 (0.543)	0.590 (0.524)	0.540 (0.496)	6.001** (2.271)	6.330* (2.634)	4.287* (1.767)	4.861** (1.696)	4.498** (1.715)	
age		0.424 (0.291)	0.321 (0.281)	0.389 (0.314)	0.407 (0.379)	0.499 (0.393)	0.625 (0.387)	0.592 (0.415)	0.559 (0.424)	
age2		-0.00362 (0.00248)	-0.00274 (0.00232)	-0.00360 (0.00275)	-0.00249 (0.00335)	-0.00348 (0.00351)	-0.00424 (0.00338)	-0.00354 (0.00363)	-0.00314 (0.00378)	
senior		-6.473*** (0.892)	-6.885*** (1.183)	-6.083*** (0.952)	-4.267*** (1.184)	-3.349** (1.245)	-3.118** (1.124)	-2.256 (1.401)	-2.328 (1.396)	
experience		0.0800 (0.0902)	0.0652 (0.0857)	0.0252 (0.137)	0.0342 (0.153)	-0.0699 (0.171)	0.469 (0.348)	0.552 (0.418)	0.540 (0.421)	
exp2		-0.00310 (0.00360)	-0.00280 (0.00353)	0.000336 (0.00603)	-0.00584 (0.00598)	-0.00254 (0.00542)	-0.00231 (0.00552)	-0.00133 (0.00580)	-0.00177 (0.00586)	
lawschool		1.114 (0.712)	0.905 (0.630)	1.255 (0.788)	0.810 (0.978)	0.946 (0.947)	1.468 (0.918)	1.676 (0.940)	1.613 (0.931)	
privatecollege		0.936 (0.574)	0.941 (0.644)	0.756 (0.644)	2.563 (1.446)	2.338 (1.355)	2.195 (1.379)	2.446 (1.330)	2.343 (1.328)	
missingcollege		0.609 (0.863)	0.720 (0.929)	-0.944 (1.689)	-1.352 (2.610)	-1.202 (2.701)	-1.299 (2.721)	-1.758 (3.181)	-1.487 (3.113)	
crossover_app		-0.380 (0.745)	-0.527 (0.738)	0.450 (0.946)	-1.373 (2.241)	-1.556 (2.268)	-0.427 (2.003)	-0.372 (1.998)	-0.185 (2.029)	
urban		-0.0306 (0.668)	0.121 (0.578)	-0.336 (0.626)	-3.866* (1.842)	-3.955* (1.823)	-3.963* (1.743)	-3.609* (1.614)	-3.668* (1.653)	

Citations (Table 5)

	(1) Incit	(2) Incit	(3) Incit	(4) Incit	(5) Incit	(6) Incit	(7) Incit	(8) Incit	(9) Incit	(10) Incit
somereverse	0.225*** (0.0278)	0.222*** (0.0281)	0.225*** (0.0286)	0.215*** (0.0289)	0.222*** (0.0292)	0.222*** (0.0294)	0.223*** (0.0295)	0.196*** (0.0300)	0.190*** (0.0302)	0.219*** (0.0293)
female		0.219** (0.0689)	0.229*** (0.0664)	0.164** (0.0566)	0.146 (0.0821)	0.0593 (0.0901)	0.129 (0.103)	0.0855 (0.0949)	0.0629 (0.0915)	
nonwhite		0.113* (0.0518)	0.130** (0.0467)	0.112* (0.0483)	0.384** (0.121)	0.342* (0.132)	0.231 (0.138)	0.314* (0.140)	0.318* (0.134)	
age		0.0301 (0.0294)	0.0393 (0.0287)	0.0198 (0.0280)	0.0572 (0.0306)	0.0747* (0.0303)	0.0858** (0.0304)	0.0917** (0.0310)	0.0907** (0.0316)	
age2		-0.000205 (0.000247)	-0.000267 (0.000241)	-0.000143 (0.000237)	-0.000494 (0.000265)	-0.000673* (0.000264)	-0.000755** (0.000264)	-0.000803** (0.000268)	-0.000788** (0.000272)	
senior		-1.201*** (0.0657)	-1.207*** (0.0754)	-1.213*** (0.0853)	-1.108*** (0.197)	-1.085*** (0.181)	-1.085*** (0.161)	-1.122*** (0.152)	-1.193*** (0.161)	
experience		0.00993 (0.00960)	0.00654 (0.0100)	0.0118 (0.0107)	0.0173 (0.0119)	0.00714 (0.0113)	0.0370 (0.0206)	0.0427* (0.0216)	0.0380 (0.0212)	
exp2		-0.000329 (0.000432)	-0.000269 (0.000463)	-0.000381 (0.000535)	-0.000382 (0.000577)	-0.0000849 (0.000557)	-0.000134 (0.000585)	-0.0000941 (0.000598)	-0.0000566 (0.000585)	
lawschool		0.0714 (0.0445)	0.0508 (0.0421)	0.0601 (0.0422)	0.100* (0.0433)	0.118** (0.0382)	0.125*** (0.0359)	0.128*** (0.0372)	0.119** (0.0365)	
privatecollege		0.0455 (0.0428)	0.0291 (0.0458)	0.0104 (0.0414)	-0.0504 (0.0468)	-0.0761 (0.0448)	-0.0708 (0.0459)	-0.0927* (0.0448)	-0.104* (0.0430)	
missingcollege		-0.0137 (0.0567)	0.0143 (0.0592)	-0.0147 (0.0571)	-0.0232 (0.0693)	0.00749 (0.0760)	-0.0354 (0.0767)	-0.0752 (0.0771)	-0.0564 (0.0752)	
crossover_app		-0.0302 (0.106)	-0.0186 (0.0945)	-0.00926 (0.0954)	-0.0981 (0.121)	-0.0593 (0.115)	0.00634 (0.115)	-0.00860 (0.117)	-0.0261 (0.112)	
urban		0.0695 (0.0416)	0.0724 (0.0421)	0.0335 (0.0421)	-0.0925 (0.0569)	-0.0940 (0.0571)	-0.0885 (0.0553)	-0.0617 (0.0541)	-0.0536 (0.0504)	

Citations (Table 5)

	(1) negative	(2) negative	(3) negative	(4) negative	(5) negative	(6) negative	(7) negative	(8) negative	(9) negative	(10) negative
citations	0.0622** (0.0206)	0.0621** (0.0205)	0.0621** (0.0205)	0.0619** (0.0203)	0.0619** (0.0202)	0.0619** (0.0202)	0.0618** (0.0202)	0.0578** (0.0171)	0.0574*** (0.0170)	0.0619** (0.0204)
somereverse	0.745*** (0.0652)	0.743*** (0.0657)	0.744*** (0.0667)	0.734*** (0.0669)	0.743*** (0.0671)	0.745*** (0.0678)	0.749*** (0.0676)	0.644*** (0.0685)	0.635*** (0.0696)	0.730*** (0.0671)
female		0.381* (0.165)	0.401* (0.168)	0.348* (0.145)	0.0282 (0.203)	-0.0458 (0.221)	0.0444 (0.253)	-0.0301 (0.239)	-0.0431 (0.236)	
nonwhite		0.101 (0.0878)	0.0809 (0.0888)	0.00177 (0.0763)	-0.0619 (0.227)	-0.0958 (0.238)	-0.328 (0.265)	-0.216 (0.283)	-0.249 (0.273)	
age		0.0348 (0.0629)	0.0287 (0.0616)	0.0255 (0.0539)	0.0710 (0.0733)	0.0882 (0.0755)	0.122 (0.0790)	0.101 (0.0648)	0.105 (0.0669)	
age2		-0.000216 (0.000538)	-0.000162 (0.000527)	-0.000182 (0.000463)	-0.000632 (0.000643)	-0.000796 (0.000664)	-0.00106 (0.000701)	-0.000888 (0.000569)	-0.000899 (0.000582)	
senior		-1.313*** (0.186)	-1.314*** (0.192)	-1.377*** (0.185)	-1.586*** (0.346)	-1.462*** (0.335)	-1.509*** (0.289)	-1.215*** (0.228)	-1.308*** (0.242)	
experience		0.0201 (0.0222)	0.0148 (0.0213)	0.0202 (0.0202)	0.0237 (0.0229)	0.00822 (0.0232)	0.0743* (0.0371)	0.0788* (0.0340)	0.0731* (0.0335)	
exp2		-0.000186 (0.00104)	0.000101 (0.00104)	0.000108 (0.00101)	0.0000559 (0.00112)	0.000614 (0.00114)	0.000490 (0.00120)	0.000769 (0.00112)	0.000789 (0.00109)	
lawschool		-0.0254 (0.0863)	-0.0200 (0.0845)	0.0141 (0.0826)	0.0588 (0.0958)	0.0486 (0.0958)	0.0384 (0.103)	0.0601 (0.103)	0.0524 (0.104)	
privatecollege		0.0831 (0.0801)	0.0795 (0.0877)	0.0260 (0.0829)	-0.0910 (0.0962)	-0.0971 (0.0985)	-0.0893 (0.107)	-0.0176 (0.119)	-0.0362 (0.117)	
missingcollege		0.00407 (0.155)	0.0385 (0.187)	-0.0372 (0.185)	-0.0832 (0.181)	-0.0667 (0.188)	-0.173 (0.179)	-0.306 (0.206)	-0.255 (0.208)	
crossover_app		-0.0120 (0.129)	-0.0384 (0.139)	0.0144 (0.0980)	0.201 (0.171)	0.225 (0.175)	0.367* (0.180)	0.448* (0.180)	0.421* (0.172)	
urban		0.215** (0.0788)	0.225** (0.0797)	0.141 (0.0759)	-0.0140 (0.170)	-0.0387 (0.168)	-0.0322 (0.171)	0.0180 (0.186)	0.0231 (0.179)	

Citations (Table 5)

- Reversed cases very strong predictor of citations. (also in logs, non-zero)
 - Receive more citations, more negative, more negative proportion
 - Also true for distinguished cases, but less so for error
- For negative citations, controlling for overall citations
 - Females receive more (sort of)
 - Cases written by seniors receive less
 - State government experience receive more
 - 7th circuit receives more
 - Methodists, Presbyterians, Baptists, Episcopalians receive less
 - Admin cases receive fewer
 - Prisoner petitions receive fewer

Citations (Table 5)

- Caution citations are much more strongly correlated with some reversal than warning citations

	(1) warning	(2) warning	(3) warning	(4) warning	(5) warning	(6) warning	(7) warning	(8) warning	(9) warning	(10) warning
citations	0.00318*** (0.000126)	0.00319*** (0.000126)	0.00319*** (0.000126)	0.00319*** (0.000126)	0.00318*** (0.000128)	0.00318*** (0.000128)	0.00318*** (0.000128)	0.00308*** (0.000132)	0.00308*** (0.000131)	0.00318*** (0.000128)
somereverse	0.0171** (0.00574)	0.0166** (0.00567)	0.0166** (0.00572)	0.0167** (0.00569)	0.0159** (0.00569)	0.0156** (0.00575)	0.0156** (0.00572)	0.0143* (0.00627)	0.0142* (0.00617)	0.0155** (0.00575)
	(1) caution	(2) caution	(3) caution	(4) caution	(5) caution	(6) caution	(7) caution	(8) caution	(9) caution	(10) caution
citations	0.0469* (0.0189)	0.0469* (0.0188)	0.0469* (0.0188)	0.0467* (0.0187)	0.0466* (0.0186)	0.0466* (0.0186)	0.0466* (0.0186)	0.0433** (0.0161)	0.0430** (0.0160)	0.0467* (0.0188)
somereverse	0.667*** (0.0591)	0.666*** (0.0597)	0.668*** (0.0604)	0.660*** (0.0600)	0.666*** (0.0601)	0.669*** (0.0609)	0.673*** (0.0607)	0.589*** (0.0627)	0.581*** (0.0637)	0.653*** (0.0602)

Citations (Table 6)

- Across all case types, reversals are negatively cited
 - Usually significant
 - When it's not - it's small N

	(1) negative	(2) negative	(3) negative	(4) negative	(5) negative	(6) negative	(7) negative	(8) negative	(9) negative	(10) negative	(11) negative
citations	0.175*** (0.0445)	0.198*** (0.0320)	0.0526*** (0.0138)	0.0560*** (0.0163)	0.198*** (0.0288)	0.250*** (0.0378)	0.174*** (0.0435)	0.218** (0.0681)	0.190*** (0.0368)	0.184*** (0.0446)	0.0420*** (0.00402)
somereverse	0.880*** (0.191)	0.522*** (0.145)	0.793*** (0.105)	0.672*** (0.0851)	0.603*** (0.120)	0.947** (0.311)	0.841*** (0.157)	0.708* (0.314)	0.416** (0.153)	0.427 (0.218)	0.657* (0.268)
	(12) negative	(13) negative	(14) negative	(15) negative	(16) negative	(17) negative	(18) negative	(19) negative	(20) negative	(21) negative	(22) negative
	0.295*** (0.0730)	0.380*** (0.0647)	0.220** (0.0794)	0.349*** (0.0906)	0.165*** (0.0389)	0.173*** (0.0276)	0.121 (0.0750)	0.304** (0.108)	0.169 (0.113)	0.217*** (0.0379)	0.266* (0.127)
	0.0246 (0.153)	-1.13e-15 (4.00e-15)	0.670 (0.823)	0.279 (0.464)	0.686*** (0.145)	0.323* (0.150)	0.301 (0.212)	0.525 (0.313)	0.617 (0.635)	0.500 (0.272)	0.114 (0.720)