

# GRADUATE STUDENT UNIONS and POSTDOC ASSOCIATIONS: Emerging Institutions and Issues in Higher Education

*Conference of November 2002, Harvard University*



Network on the Scientific Workforce at NBER  
Labor and Worklife Program at Harvard Law School  
Sponsored by the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation

## GRADUATE STUDENT UNIONS AND POSTDOC ASSOCIATIONS: Emerging Institutions and Issues in Higher Education

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

#### I. The Economic Context

1. William J. Baumol and Sue Anne Batey Blackman, "How to Think About Rising College Costs," *Planning for Higher Education*, Summer 1995 [page 6]
2. Sara Hebel, "Skyrocketing Public-College Tuition Renews Calls for Better Policies," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 25 October 2002 [page 13]
3. Scott Smallwood, "Stipends Are Key in Competition to Land Top Graduate Students," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 28 September 2001 [page 15]
4. Mark C. Regets, "Has the Use of Postdocs Changed?," NSF Division of Science Resources Studies *Issue Brief*, 2 December 1998 [page 19]
5. GESO, "The Postdoc Crisis," ca. 2001 [page 23]
6. Association of American Universities (AAU), "Committee on Postdoctoral Education: Report and Recommendations," 31 March 1998 [page 29]
7. Erica Goldman and Eliot Marshall, "NIH Grantees: Where Have All the Young Ones Gone?," *Science*, vol. 298, 4 October 2002 [page 36]
8. Naomi Kraus, "Scientific World's Low Tolerance for Controversy May Be What's Excluding Young Investigators," excerpted from *The Scientist*, vol. 8, #24, 12 December 1994 [page 38]
9. NIH Research Training Budget and Pre-Doctoral and Post-Doctoral Positions (slides) [page 40]
10. Walter T. Schaffer, National Institutes of Health, "National Research Service Award (NRSA) Stipend Increase and Other Budgetary Changes Effective for Fiscal Year 2002," 22 January 2002 [page 42]
11. Coalition of Graduate Employee Unions, *Casual Nation* [page 44]
12. Eric L. Wee, "Professor of Desperation," *Washington Post Magazine*, 21 July 2002 [page 52]
13. Phyllis M. Frakt and James O. Castagnera, "Rider University Addresses Adjunct Faculty Concerns," *Matrix*, November/December 2000 [page 59]
14. Katie Cottingham, "Insights from Funders: A Discussion of Postdoctoral Support," *Science's Next Wave*, 17 May 2002 [page 61]
15. Karen Kreeger, "Private foundations push for higher postdoc salaries," *Naturejobs*, 10 January 2002 [page 64]
16. Mark Pidkowich, "Postdocs at Brookhaven: Establishing a Living Wage," *Science's Next Wave*, 19 April 2002 [page 65]
17. Richard Weibl, "Value of Postdoc Fellowships Vary Widely by Field," *Science's Next Wave*, 2 November 2001 [page 68]
18. Stephen Greene, "Tax Law Shrinks Stipends," *The Scientist*, 19 October 1987 [page 73]

#### II. Recent Developments

1. Steven Greenhouse, "Cornell Graduate Assistants Vote Decisively Against Union," *New York Times*, 26 October 2002 [page 75]

2. Shinzong Lee, "Cornell grad union fails in NLRB vote," *Yale Daily News*, 28 October 2002 [page 76]
3. Shinzong Lee, "Union supporters leaflet at Parents' Weekend panel: Police detain two students inside Woolsey for distributing flyers to students, parents," *Yale Daily News*, 14 October 2002 [page 77]
4. Stuart Silverstein and Claire Luna, "Strikes Shut Down Some UC Classes," *Los Angeles Times*, 15 October 2002 [page 78]
5. UAW News, "UAW members at University of California to honor picket lines during unfair labor practice strike by lecturers, clerical workers," 13 October 2002 [page 80]
6. GESO, "Ivy League Unions Growing," 19 June 2002 [page 81]
7. "More grad students eligible for union," *Chicago Tribune*, 7 June 2002 [page 82]
8. Meg McSherry Breslin, "U. of I. grad students get offer," *Chicago Tribune*, 14 March 2002 [page 83]
9. "Union Moves Shake Two Campuses," *Science*, vol. 294, 7 December 2001 [page 84]
10. Yili Zhao, "Columbia Graduate Assistants Strike to Support Union Effort," *New York Times*, 30 April 2002 [page 85]
11. Kenneth R. Weiss, "Private Universities' Grad Students Get Right to Unionize," *Los Angeles Times*, 2 November 2000 [page 86]
12. Joel Budd, "Ivory power," *Guardian Education supplement*, 4 September 2001 [page 88]
13. Andrew C. Helman and David Abel, "UMass Ras face historic union vote," *Boston Globe*, 23 January 2002 [page 90]
14. "Temple Teaching Assistants Win Ruling in Union Drive," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 7 September 2001 [page 91]
15. Ana Marie Cox, "Looking (Without Much Success) for New Ways to Help Postdocs," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 23 March 2001 [page 92]
16. Scott Smallwood, "A Big Breakthrough for T.A. Unions: NYU becomes first private institution to negotiate, but will others follow?," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 16 March 2001 [page 93]
17. Kyle Grimshaw, "A Victory for the Student Researcher: Chou v. University of Chicago," ca. 2001 [page 95]

### III. The Case against Grad Student Unionization

1. Scott Smallwood, "Union? No Thanks. Some graduate students at elite universities fight the push for collective bargaining," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 17 May 2002 [page 100]
2. Edward A. Brill and Tracey I. Levy, "Are You Prepared for Student Unionization?," *NACUBO Business Officer*, July 2002 [page 103]
3. GSAU / Graduate Students Against Unionization [page 107]
  - a) Adam Meshel, "We are the Union?"
  - b) "Graduate Student Strikes, UAW-Style"
  - c) "Twelve Facts About the Union"
4. Deputy Provost Peter Conn, "Information about Graduate Student Unionization at Penn," 16 October 2001 [page 112]
5. Columbia University critic of unionization, "What does Economics tell us about Unionization?" [page 114]
6. Joshua Potter, "Teaching Assistant Unionization at the University of Washington" [page 115]
7. Colin Costin, Graduate Students for an Informed Choice on Unionization (GSICU), "Comparison of

Wages and Benefits at the University of Washington and Several Peer Institutions" [page 119]

8. Jennifer L. Burns, "Harvard TFs Happy; See No Labor Problems," *Harvard Crimson*, 6 February 1997 [page 129]
9. Paul Kennedy, "The International Brotherhood of Eggheads," *Wall Street Journal*, 25 March 1999 [page 130]
10. Catharine R. Stimpson, "A Dean's Skepticism About a Graduate-Student Union," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 5 May 2000 [page 131]
11. Anthony Kronman, "Are Graduate Students Workers?," *New York Times*, 19 May 2001 [page 133]
12. Courtney Leatherman, "As Teaching Assistants Push to Unionize, Debate Grows Over What They Would Gain," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 3 October 1997 [page 134]
13. Ruth J. Simmons, president of Brown University, "Unions and Teaching Assistants," letter of 27 November 2001 [page 136]
14. Ethan Horowitz, "Pres. Simmons vows to fight against grad student unionization," *Brown Daily Herald*, 26 September 2001 [page 138]

#### **IV. The Case for Graduate Student Unions**

1. Gordon Lafer, "Graduate Student Unions Fight the Corporate University," *Dissent*, Fall 2001 [page 140]
2. Kate Bronfenbrenner and Tom Juravich, "Universities Should Cease Hostilities with Unions," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 19 January 2001 [page 148]
3. Kim Phillips-Fein, "Yale Bites Unions: For God, Country, and the Ruling Class," *The Nation*, 2 July 2001 [page 149]
4. Jane Manners, "Joe Hill Goes to Harvard," *The Nation*, 2 July 2001 [page 152]
5. GESO, "Casual in Blue: Yale and the Academic Labor Market," ca. 1999 [page 155]
6. Courtney Leatherman, "Yale's Labor Strife Leads Some of Its Ph.D.'s to Abandon Academe for Union Organizing," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 5 December 1997 [page 167]
7. GSEU, "SUNY Employees Declare Day of Shame," 25 September 2000 [page 169]
8. Rabiya S. Tuma, "Grad Student Unionization: Grave Predictions Unmet?," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 March 2001 [page 172]
9. Gordon J. Hewitt, "Graduate Student Employee Collective Bargaining and the Educational Relationship between Faculty and Graduate Students," *Journal of Collective Negotiations in the Public Sector*, vol. 29 (2), 2000 [page 175]

#### **V. The Emergence of Postdoc Movements, Associations, and Networks**

1. Joanne P. Cavanaugh, "The Postdoc's Plight: Underpaid, overworked, and often under-regarded....," *Johns Hopkins Magazine*, February 1999 [page 189]
2. Laurel Haak, "Leading the Charge: Institutional Postdoctoral Policies," *Science's Next Wave*, 16 August 2002 [page 196]
3. Postdoc Network, "How to Form a Postdoc Association," *Science's Next Wave*, 10 November 2000 [page 201]
4. Kelly Karpa, "Establishing Offices for Postdoctoral Education: Overcoming Obstacles, Part 2," *Science's Next Wave*, 1 June 2001 [page 203]
5. Audrey Ettinger, "History and Evolution of the Stanford University Postdocs Association," *Science's Next Wave*, 18 May 2001 [page 206]

6. David Bucci, "Establishing a Postdoctoral Association at Brown University," *Science's Next Wave*, 2 February 2001 [page 209]
7. James Fiordalisi, "Who Shall Lead? The New UNC Postdoc Association Takes Big Steps," *Science's Next Wave*, 21 September 2001 [page 212]
8. Stephen Gasior, "Agitators on the Inside," *Science's Next Wave*, 16 November 2001 [page 215]
9. Orfeu M. Buxton and Stephen Gasior, "Surveying Postdocs: A Tale from the Trenches," *Science's Next Wave*, 4 January 2002 [page 218]
10. Orfeu Buxton and Stephen Gasior, "You've Got the Data! Now Advocate for Change!," *Science's Next Wave*, 19 April 2002 [page 221]
11. Karen Christopherson, "Postdoc Production," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 224]
12. Jonathan Dando, "Postdocs: Your Future is in YOUR Hands!," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 227]
13. Claire Davies, "Calling the 'Postdoc' Monster," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 229]
14. Avi Spier, "Postdoc Production: Negative Selection of the Scientists of the Future?," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 232]
15. Massimo Lazzari, "Postdoctoral Training: a European Perspective," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 235]
16. Jonathan W. Yewdell, "An Enron of Our Own," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 237]
17. Sharon Milgram, "Postdoc Policy Forum: Think Globally; Act Locally," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 240]
18. Trevor Penning, "Are There Too Many Postdoctoral Scientists?," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 242]
19. Martha Borgmann Crago, "The Need and Development of Highly qualified Personnel in Canada: Reconceptualization of the Postdoctoral Experience," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 245]
20. Richard A. Cherwitz and Teresa A. Sullivan, "Postdocs as Intellectual Entrepreneurs," *Science's Next Wave* [page 248]
21. Richard Freeman, "Thanks for the Great Postdoc Bargain," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 251]
22. Geoff Davis, "Postdoc Economics," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 253]
23. David Clark, "Are There Too Many Post-Docs?," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 256]
24. Rita Colwell, "Perspectives from NSF on the Postdoctoral Experience," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 259]
25. Karl Tibelius, "Postdoc Production: The Canadian Institutes of Health Research Perspective," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 261]
26. Torsten Wiesel, "Climbing the Tree of Science," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 265]
27. Timothy Coetzee, "Postdoc Production – A Funding Agency Perspective," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 268]
28. John Marburger, "Developing Science Workforce Policy: 2<sup>nd</sup> National Postdoc Network Meeting, Keynote Address," *Science's Next Wave*, 17 May 2002 [page 270]
29. Emily Klotz, "Postdocs Are Not All Created Equal – Postdoc Status, Part 1," *Science's Next Wave*, 10 November 2000 [page 272]
30. Emily Klotz, "Postdocs Are Not All Created Equal – Postdoc Status, Part 2," *Science's Next Wave*, 17 November 2000 [page 273]

31. SUPD Table on Visas and Postdocs [page 276]
32. Emily Klotz and Lisa McCawley, "Sharing Solutions to Postdoc Needs: A Summary of the Postdoc Network National Meeting, Part 1," *Science's Next Wave*, 16 March 2001 [page 280]
33. Emily Klotz, "Sharing Solutions to Postdoc Needs: A Summary of the Postdoc Network National Meeting, Part 2," *Science's Next Wave*, 6 April 2001 [page 284]
34. T.L. Nally, "Survey of Surveys I: What Postdoc Association Surveys Tell Us About Postdoc Working Conditions," *Science's Next Wave*, 21 June 2002 [page 287]
35. T.L. Nally, "Survey of Surveys II: Polling Postdocs Effectively," *Science's Next Wave*, 5 July 2002 [page 291]
36. Laurel Haak, "Part I. Federal Science Policy and the Postdoc: What Do Postdocs Wants?," *Science's Next Wave*, 1 February 2002 [page 294]
37. Laurel Haak, "Strategies to Benefit Postdocs: A Guide to Best Practices," *Science's Next Wave*, 7 June 2002 [page 298]
38. Richard Weibl, "Anticipation... Is Getting Me Down," *Science's Next Wave*, 12 October 2001 [page 302]
39. Leslie Pray, "National Poll Reveals Progress and Differences," *Science's Next Wave*, 3 August 2001 [page 304]
40. Laurel Haak, "Postdoc Issues and Solutions: A Report from the AAAS Meeting," *Science's Next Wave*, 15 March 2002 [page 308]
41. Laurel Haak, "Investing in Postdoctoral Research: The Frederick Gardner Cottrell Postdoctoral Enhancement Awards," *Science's Next Wave*, 4 October 2002 [page 311]
42. Jim Austin, "Another Scientist Shortage?," *Science's Next Wave*, 25 October 2002 [page 314]
43. Kirstie Urquhart, "Serial Postdoc Killer?," *Science's Next Wave*, 25 October 2002 [page 317]
44. Jerry Gabriel, "Raising Their Voices: The Emergence of Postdoc Grievance Procedures," *Science's Next Wave*, 5 April 2002 [page 320]
45. Robert Bartolo, "Lobbying Congress: A New Role for Postdocs?," *Science's Next Wave*, 7 September 2001 [page 323]
46. Deborah Swope, "Learning from Experience: Postdoc Associations Share Their Wisdom on Getting Started and Forging Ahead," *Science's Next Wave*, 19 January 2001 [page 326]
47. Tom Peavy, "All for One, and One for All: Creation of a UC-wide Postdoc Association," *Science's Next Wave*, 5 April 2002 [page 330]
48. Minutes of SUPD-PAC meeting with William Gould, former chair of the NLRB, 12 September 2001 [page 333]
49. Stanford Postdoc Survey 2002 [page 337]
50. Lisa M. Kozlowski, "Power to the Postdocs: The Johns Hopkins Postdoctoral Association" [page 344]