

GRADUATE STUDENT UNIONS and POSTDOC ASSOCIATIONS: Emerging Institutions and Issues in Higher Education

Conference of November 2002, Harvard University



Network on the Scientific Workforce at NBER
Labor and Worklife Program at Harvard Law School
Sponsored by the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation

GRADUATE STUDENT UNIONS AND POSTDOC ASSOCIATIONS: Emerging Institutions and Issues in Higher Education

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. The Economic Context

1. William J. Baumol and Sue Anne Batey Blackman, "How to Think About Rising College Costs," *Planning for Higher Education*, Summer 1995 [page 6]
2. Sara Hebel, "Skyrocketing Public-College Tuition Renews Calls for Better Policies," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 25 October 2002 [page 13]
3. Scott Smallwood, "Stipends Are Key in Competition to Land Top Graduate Students," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 28 September 2001 [page 15]
4. Mark C. Regets, "Has the Use of Postdocs Changed?," NSF Division of Science Resources Studies *Issue Brief*, 2 December 1998 [page 19]
5. GESO, "The Postdoc Crisis," ca. 2001 [page 23]
6. Association of American Universities (AAU), "Committee on Postdoctoral Education: Report and Recommendations," 31 March 1998 [page 29]
7. Erica Goldman and Eliot Marshall, "NIH Grantees: Where Have All the Young Ones Gone?," *Science*, vol. 298, 4 October 2002 [page 36]
8. Naomi Kraus, "Scientific World's Low Tolerance for Controversy May Be What's Excluding Young Investigators," excerpted from *The Scientist*, vol. 8, #24, 12 December 1994 [page 38]
9. NIH Research Training Budget and Pre-Doctoral and Post-Doctoral Positions (slides) [page 40]
10. Walter T. Schaffer, National Institutes of Health, "National Research Service Award (NRSA) Stipend Increase and Other Budgetary Changes Effective for Fiscal Year 2002," 22 January 2002 [page 42]
11. Coalition of Graduate Employee Unions, *Casual Nation* [page 44]
12. Eric L. Wee, "Professor of Desperation," *Washington Post Magazine*, 21 July 2002 [page 52]
13. Phyllis M. Frakt and James O. Castagnera, "Rider University Addresses Adjunct Faculty Concerns," *Matrix*, November/December 2000 [page 59]
14. Katie Cottingham, "Insights from Funders: A Discussion of Postdoctoral Support," *Science's Next Wave*, 17 May 2002 [page 61]
15. Karen Kreeger, "Private foundations push for higher postdoc salaries," *Naturejobs*, 10 January 2002 [page 64]
16. Mark Pidkowich, "Postdocs at Brookhaven: Establishing a Living Wage," *Science's Next Wave*, 19 April 2002 [page 65]
17. Richard Weibl, "Value of Postdoc Fellowships Vary Widely by Field," *Science's Next Wave*, 2 November 2001 [page 68]
18. Stephen Greene, "Tax Law Shrinks Stipends," *The Scientist*, 19 October 1987 [page 73]

II. Recent Developments

1. Steven Greenhouse, "Cornell Graduate Assistants Vote Decisively Against Union," *New York Times*, 26 October 2002 [page 75]

2. Shinzong Lee, "Cornell grad union fails in NLRB vote," *Yale Daily News*, 28 October 2002 [page 76]
3. Shinzong Lee, "Union supporters leaflet at Parents' Weekend panel: Police detain two students inside Woolsey for distributing flyers to students, parents," *Yale Daily News*, 14 October 2002 [page 77]
4. Stuart Silverstein and Claire Luna, "Strikes Shut Down Some UC Classes," *Los Angeles Times*, 15 October 2002 [page 78]
5. UAW News, "UAW members at University of California to honor picket lines during unfair labor practice strike by lecturers, clerical workers," 13 October 2002 [page 80]
6. GESO, "Ivy League Unions Growing," 19 June 2002 [page 81]
7. "More grad students eligible for union," *Chicago Tribune*, 7 June 2002 [page 82]
8. Meg McSherry Breslin, "U. of I. grad students get offer," *Chicago Tribune*, 14 March 2002 [page 83]
9. "Union Moves Shake Two Campuses," *Science*, vol. 294, 7 December 2001 [page 84]
10. Yilu Zhao, "Columbia Graduate Assistants Strike to Support Union Effort," *New York Times*, 30 April 2002 [page 85]
11. Kenneth R. Weiss, "Private Universities' Grad Students Get Right to Unionize," *Los Angeles Times*, 2 November 2000 [page 86]
12. Joel Budd, "Ivory power," *Guardian Education* supplement, 4 September 2001 [page 88]
13. Andrew C. Helman and David Abel, "UMass Ras face historic union vote," *Boston Globe*, 23 January 2002 [page 90]
14. "Temple Teaching Assistants Win Ruling in Union Drive," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 7 September 2001 [page 91]
15. Ana Marie Cox, "Looking (Without Much Success) for New Ways to Help Postdocs," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 23 March 2001 [page 92]
16. Scott Smallwood, "A Big Breakthrough for T.A. Unions: NYU becomes first private institution to negotiate, but will others follow?," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 16 March 2001 [page 93]
17. Kyle Grimshaw, "A Victory for the Student Researcher: Chou v. University of Chicago," ca. 2001 [page 95]

III. The Case against Grad Student Unionization

1. Scott Smallwood, "Union? No Thanks. Some graduate students at elite universities fight the push for collective bargaining," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 17 May 2002 [page 100]
2. Edward A. Brill and Tracey I. Levy, "Are You Prepared for Student Unionization?," *NACUBO Business Officer*, July 2002 [page 103]
3. GSAU / Graduate Students Against Unionization [page 107]
 - a) Adam Meshel, "We are the Union?"
 - b) "Graduate Student Strikes, UAW-Style"
 - c) "Twelve Facts About the Union"
4. Deputy Provost Peter Conn, "Information about Graduate Student Unionization at Penn," 16 October 2001 [page 112]
5. Columbia University critic of unionization, "What does Economics tell us about Unionization?" [page 114]
6. Joshua Potter, "Teaching Assistant Unionization at the University of Washington" [page 115]
7. Colin Costin, Graduate Students for an Informed Choice on Unionization (GSICU), "Comparison of

- Wages and Benefits at the University of Washington and Several Peer Institutions” [page 119]
8. Jennifer L. Burns, “Harvard TFs Happy; See No Labor Problems,” *Harvard Crimson*, 6 February 1997 [page 129]
 9. Paul Kennedy, “The International Brotherhood of Eggheads,” *Wall Street Journal*, 25 March 1999 [page 130]
 10. Catharine R. Stimpson, “A Dean’s Skepticism About a Graduate-Student Union,” *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 5 May 2000 [page 131]
 11. Anthony Kronman, “Are Graduate Students Workers?,” *New York Times*, 19 May 2001 [page 133]
 12. Courtney Leatherman, “As Teaching Assistants Push to Unionize, Debate Grows Over What They Would Gain,” *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 3 October 1997 [page 134]
 13. Ruth J. Simmons, president of Brown University, “Unions and Teaching Assistants,” letter of 27 November 2001 [page 136]
 14. Ethan Horowitz, “Pres. Simmons vows to fight against grad student unionization,” *Brown Daily Herald*, 26 September 2001 [page 138]

IV. The Case for Graduate Student Unions

1. Gordon Lafer, “Graduate Student Unions Fight the Corporate University,” *Dissent*, Fall 2001 [page 140]
2. Kate Bronfenbrenner and Tom Juravich, “Universities Should Cease Hostilities with Unions,” *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 19 January 2001 [page 148]
3. Kim Phillips-Fein, “Yale Bites Unions: For God, Country, and the Ruling Class,” *The Nation*, 2 July 2001 [page 149]
4. Jane Manners, “Joe Hill Goes to Harvard,” *The Nation*, 2 July 2001 [page 152]
5. GESO, “Casual in Blue: Yale and the Academic Labor Market,” ca. 1999 [page 155]
6. Courtney Leatherman, “Yale’s Labor Strife Leads Some of Its Ph.D.’s to Abandon Academe for Union Organizing,” *Chronicle of Higher Education*, 5 December 1997 [page 167]
7. GSEU, “SUNY Employees Declare Day of Shame,” 25 September 2000 [page 169]
8. Rabiya S. Tuma, “Grad Student Unionization: Grave Predictions Unmet?,” *Science’s Next Wave*, 30 March 2001 [page 172]
9. Gordon J. Hewitt, “Graduate Student Employee Collective Bargaining and the Educational Relationship between Faculty and Graduate Students,” *Journal of Collective Negotiations in the Public Sector*, vol. 29 (2), 2000 [page 175]

V. The Emergence of Postdoc Movements, Associations, and Networks

1. Joanne P. Cavanaugh, “The Postdoc’s Plight: Underpaid, overworked, and often under-regarded....,” *Johns Hopkins Magazine*, February 1999 [page 189]
2. Laurel Haak, “Leading the Charge: Institutional Postdoctoral Policies,” *Science’s Next Wave*, 16 August 2002 [page 196]
3. Postdoc Network, “How to Form a Postdoc Association,” *Science’s Next Wave*, 10 November 2000 [page 201]
4. Kelly Karpa, “Establishing Offices for Postdoctoral Education: Overcoming Obstacles, Part 2,” *Science’s Next Wave*, 1 June 2001 [page 203]
5. Audrey Ettinger, “History and Evolution of the Stanford University Postdocs Association,” *Science’s Next Wave*, 18 May 2001 [page 206]

6. David Bucci, "Establishing a Postdoctoral Association at Brown University," *Science's Next Wave*, 2 February 2001 [page 209]
7. James Fiordalisi, "Who Shall Lead? The New UNC Postdoc Association Takes Big Steps," *Science's Next Wave*, 21 September 2001 [page 212]
8. Stephen Gasior, "Agitators on the Inside," *Science's Next Wave*, 16 November 2001 [page 215]
9. Orfeu M. Buxton and Stephen Gasior, "Surveying Postdocs: A Tale from the Trenches," *Science's Next Wave*, 4 January 2002 [page 218]
10. Orfeu Buxton and Stephen Gasior, "You've Got the Data! Now Advocate for Change!," *Science's Next Wave*, 19 April 2002 [page 221]
11. Karen Christopherson, "Postdoc Production," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 224]
12. Jonathan Dando, "Postdocs: Your Future is in YOUR Hands!," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 227]
13. Claire Davies, "Calling the 'Postdoc' Monster," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 229]
14. Avi Spier, "Postdoc Production: Negative Selection of the Scientists of the Future?," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 232]
15. Massimo Lazzari, "Postdoctoral Training: a European Perspective," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 235]
16. Jonathan W. Yewdell, "An Enron of Our Own," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 237]
17. Sharon Milgram, "Postdoc Policy Forum: Think Globally; Act Locally," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 240]
18. Trevor Penning, "Are There Too Many Postdoctoral Scientists?," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 242]
19. Martha Borgmann Crago, "The Need and Development of Highly qualified Personnel in Canada: Reconceptualization of the Postdoctoral Experience," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 245]
20. Richard A. Cherwitz and Teresa A. Sullivan, "Postdocs as Intellectual Entrepreneurs," *Science's Next Wave* [page 248]
21. Richard Freeman, "Thanks for the Great Postdoc Bargain," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 251]
22. Geoff Davis, "Postdoc Economics," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 253]
23. David Clark, "Are There Too Many Post-Docs?," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 256]
24. Rita Colwell, "Perspectives from NSF on the Postdoctoral Experience," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 259]
25. Karl Tibelius, "Postdoc Production: The Canadian Institutes of Health Research Perspective," *Science's Next Wave*, 30 August 2002 [page 261]
26. Torsten Wiesel, "Climbing the Tree of Science," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 265]
27. Timothy Coetzee, "Postdoc Production – A Funding Agency Perspective," *Science's Next Wave*, 13 September 2002 [page 268]
28. John Marburger, "Developing Science Workforce Policy: 2nd National Postdoc Network Meeting, Keynote Address," *Science's Next Wave*, 17 May 2002 [page 270]
29. Emily Klotz, "Postdocs Are Not All Created Equal – Postdoc Status, Part 1," *Science's Next Wave*, 10 November 2000 [page 272]
30. Emily Klotz, "Postdocs Are Not All Created Equal – Postdoc Status, Part 2," *Science's Next Wave*, 17 November 2000 [page 273]

31. SUPD Table on Visas and Postdocs [page 276]
32. Emily Klotz and Lisa McCawley, "Sharing Solutions to Postdoc Needs: A Summary of the Postdoc Network National Meeting, Part 1," *Science's Next Wave*, 16 March 2001 [page 280]
33. Emily Klotz, "Sharing Solutions to Postdoc Needs: A Summary of the Postdoc Network National Meeting, Part 2," *Science's Next Wave*, 6 April 2001 [page 284]
34. T.L. Nally, "Survey of Surveys I: What Postdoc Association Surveys Tell Us About Postdoc Working Conditions," *Science's Next Wave*, 21 June 2002 [page 287]
35. T.L. Nally, "survey of Surveys II: Polling Postdocs Effectively," *Science's Next Wave*, 5 July 2002 [page 291]
36. Laurel Haak, "Part I. Federal Science Policy and the Postdoc: What Do Postdocs Wants?," *Science's Next Wave*, 1 February 2002 [page 294]
37. Laurel Haak, "Strategies to Benefit Postdocs: A Guide to Best Practices," *Science's Next Wave*, 7 June 2002 [page 298]
38. Richard Weibl, "Anticipation... Is Getting Me Down," *Science's Next Wave*, 12 October 2001 [page 302]
39. Leslie Pray, "National Poll Reveals Progress and Differences," *Science's Next Wave*, 3 August 2001 [page 304]
40. Laurel Haak, "Postdoc Issues and Solutions: A Report from the AAAS Meeting," *Science's Next Wave*, 15 March 2002 [page 308]
41. Laurel Haak, "Investing in Postdoctoral Research: The Frederick Gardner Cottrell Postdoctoral Enhancement Awards," *Science's Next Wave*, 4 October 2002 [page 311]
42. Jim Austin, "Another Scientist Shortage?," *Science's Next Wave*, 25 October 2002 [page 314]
43. Kirstie Urquhart, "Serial Postdoc Killer?," *Science's Next Wave*, 25 October 2002 [page 317]
44. Jerry Gabriel, "Raising Their Voices: The Emergence of Postdoc Grievance Procedures," *Science's Next Wave*, 5 April 2002 [page 320]
45. Robert Bartolo, "Lobbying Congress: A New Role for Postdocs/," *Science's Next Wave*, 7 September 2001 [page 323]
46. Deborah Swope, "Learning from Experience: Postdoc Associations Share Their Wisdom on Getting Started and Forging Ahead," *Science's Next Wave*, 19 January 2001 [page 326]
47. Tom Peavy, "All for One, and One for All: Creation of a UC-wide Postdoc Association," *Science's Next Wave*, 5 April 2002 [page 330]
48. Minutes of SUPD-PAC meeting with William Gould, former chair of the NLRB, 12 September 2001 [page 333]
49. Stanford Postdoc Survey 2002 [page 337]
50. Lisa M. Kozlowski, "Power to the Postdocs: The Johns Hopkins Postdoctoral Association" [page 344]